COVID-19 vaccines

Monica Gandhi MD, MPH

Professor of Medicine, Division of HIV, Infectious Diseases and Global Medicine Medical Director, Ward 86 and Director, UCSF Center for AIDS Research Osher Mini Medical School June 15, 2021

Have we ever seen coronavirus cause more than the "common cold" before?



- This new coronavirus is causing more severe symptoms than "upper respiratory infection" symptoms, like fever, cough, shortness of breath, sometimes even pneumonia
- We had another coronavirus which came out in the world like this in 2002 and yet another in 2012 so this is the 3rd time

Another coronavirus named SARS came out in 2002-3: Didn't just cause cold but worse symptoms

- In 2002, there was another virus that came out of China called "SARS" -Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS-CoV-1)
- Lasted about 9 months in the world until 2003; 8098 cases, 29 countries, 774 deaths
- 29 cases in U.S. but 0 deaths, more in Canada
- Horseshoe bat, then cat-like mammal called palm civet \rightarrow human \rightarrow human to human





Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus in 2012 (MERS-CoV)

- First came out in Saudi Arabia in 2012; all cases linked to Middle East
- Went around world from 2012-2019: 27 countries, 2494 cases, 858 deaths
- United States: 2 cases in May 2014 (Indiana, Florida) – both health care workers from Saudi Arabia
- Was originally in camel and then went to humans then human to human



What about this new coronavirus?

- Illness with fever, cough, pneumonia reported in Wuhan, China on New Years' Eve (December 31, 2019) after "whistleblower event'
- January 7, 2020: Identified etiology a new coronavirus
- Has been spreading around world since then
- January 30, 2020: WHO "global health emergency"
- March 11, 2020: WHO "Pandemic"
- March 26, 2020: US became epicenter of pandemic and then
- March 5, 2021: Cases started rising in India





Company or name	Form of publication for phase 3 data/ type of vaccine	Reference
moderna	Peer reviewed publication/ mRNA	<u>Baden NEJM</u> , Feb 4, 2021
Pfizer	Peer reviewed publication/ mRNA	Polack NEJM, December 31, 2020
Johnson-Johnson	Press release only/ adenovirus + DNA	J&J <u>press release</u> January 29, 2021; <u>FDA document</u> Feb 24
AstraZeneca	Two peer-reviewed publications but ongoing (adenovirus + DNA)	Voysey Lancet December 8, 2020; Preprint Feb 1, 2021
NOVAVAX Creating Tomorrow's Vaccines Today	Press release, abstract, press release (phase 3 UK; phase 2b S. Africa; phase 3 US/Mexico)	Novavax press release 1/28 and NYAS abstract 2/2/21; press release June 14
Sputnik V	Peer-reviewed publication (DNA plus adenovirus)	Logunov Lancet, February 2, 2021
Sinovac [.]	Publication (whole inactivated)	Sinopharm, JAMA, May 28, 2021
	Publication (whole inactivated)	<u>Sinovac</u> , JAMA May 28, 2021
BHARAT	Press release (whole inactivated)	Bharat Covaxin, April 21, 2021

There are actually 9 vaccines out there for COVID-19, three authorized in U.S. 6 vaccine candidates to date involve spike protein and receptor binding domain of SARS-CoV-2 - either mRNA or adenoviral-vector DNA vaccines or protein adjuvant itself; 3 inactivated virus



Three types of vaccines involving spike protein

- mRNA vaccines (2)
- Adenoviral vector DNA vaccines (3)
- Spike protein + M-adjuvant vaccine (1)

Three vaccines whole inactivated virions





Remember immunity -antibodies and cell-mediated



Most vaccine trials measured antibodies and T cell responses

Inture DETTERS Australizing antibodies derived from the B cells of p18 influenza pandemic survivors Niacong Yu ^{1*} , Tshidi Tsibane ^{**} , Patricia A. McGraw ¹ , Frances S. House ¹ , Christopher J. Keefer ¹ , Mark D. Hicar ¹ , Terrence M. Tumpey ³ , Claudia Pappas ²⁻³ , Lucy A. Perrone ³ , Osvaldo Martinez ² , James Stevens ¹⁴ , Ian A. Wilson ⁴ , Patricia V. Aguilar ² , Eric L. Altschuler ² , Christopher F. Basler ⁴ & James E. Crowe Jr ¹	Article SARS-CoV-2-specific T cell immunity in cases of COVID-19 and SARS, and uninfected controls nature reviews immunology	Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications T cell immunity to SARS-CoV-2 following natural infection and vaccination ARTICLE Highly functional virus-specific cellular immune response in asymptomatic SARS-CoV-2 infection	
nature reviews immunology	How does functional modulate severity of	T-cell response disease?	
T cell responses in patients with COVID-19	T cell responses modulate the severity of disease		
	 Strong T cell responses in all of these trials seem to have led to prevention of severe disease 		
	 JEM study shows us that those with asymptomatic infection mounted good T cell responses to COVID-19 		
CelPress Trends in Immunology	 If you get re-infected after n (rare), should be mild if mou 	atural infection or vaccine nted good T-cell response	
Opinion T Cells: Warriors of SARS-CoV-2 Infection	 Fun fact: Study from 1918 su show durable B cell immunit 	irvivors of influenza pandemic y (memory B- Ab) 90 years later!	

Company	Platform	Doses	Non-clinical results	# with vaccine (same placebo)	Protection from COVID-19 hospitalization	Protection from COVID severe dz (some at home)	Efficacy against milder COVID
moderna	mRNA-1273 mRNA in lipid nanoparticle	2	Neutralizing Abs; Strong Th1 CD4+ protection from challenge (macaques)	~15,000	90% (1 in vaccine arm <u>after 2nd dose</u> <u>hospitalized</u>)	97% (30 cases in placebo arm; 0 in vaccine reported but 1 severe per FDA)	94.1%
P fizer	BNT162b2 mRNA in lipid nanoparticle	2	Neutralizing Abs; Strong Th1 CD4+, CD8+; protection from challenge (macaques)	~18,600	100%	100% (9 cases in placebo arm; 0 in vaccine- <u>1 initially</u> <u>severe but not</u>)	95%
Johnron-Johnron	JNJ-78436725 Non-replicating human adenovirus/DNA	1	Neutralizing Abs; Strong Th1 CD4+ > Th2; CD8+; challenge protection (macaque)	~22,000 US, Latin America, S. Africa	100%	85.4% across 3 sites (7 deaths, 16 hospitalizations, all in placebo arm)	72% US; 61% Latin America; 64% S. Africa (95% B1.351)
AstraZeneca	AZD 1222 Non-replicating Chimp Adenovirus- DNA	2	Neutralizing Abs; Strong Th1 CD4+ > Th2; CD8+; protection from challenge (macaques)	~28,588 (UK, SA, US/Peru/ Chili)	100%	100% (UK, 15 placebo arm hospitalized, 0 in vaccine; US, 8 severe in placebo, 0 vaccine)	76% US (85% in >65 yrs); 70% UK; S. Africa halted for mild
NOVAVAX Creating Tomorrow's Vaccines Today	NVX-CoV2373 Spike protein/RBD + Matrix M adjuvant	2	Neutralizing Abs; Strong Th1 CD4 > Th2; macaque challenge protection	8833 (Phase 3 UK; 2b SA); 12.5K (Φ 3)	100%	100% (24 severe placebo in UK/SA/US /MX; 0 vaccine)	90.4% US/MX; 100% severe; 93.2% variants
S . putnik V	Ad26 and Ad5 adenovirus/DNA	2	NAbs; IFN-γ secretion PMBCs, cellular response	~14964	100%	100% (20 in placebo; 0 vaccine)	91.6%

Company	Platform	Doses	Non-clinical results	# with vaccine (same placebo)	Protection from COVID-19 hospitalization	Efficacy against milder COVID
BHARAT	Inactivated whole virus	2	Neutralizing Abs; Strong Th1 CD4 responses in phase II trial (<u>Lancet</u>)	11,000 (<u>press</u> <u>release</u> 4/21)	100%	78%
<pre>\$sinovac</pre>	Whole inactivated virion	2	Neutralizing Abs; IFN- gamma assays T cell responses	13,068	100%	72.8%
SINOPHARM	Whole inactivated virion	2	Neutralizing Abs; IFN- gamma assays T cell responses	13,068	100%	78.1%

Two mRNA vaccines clinical trials



- 2 shots, 3 weeks apart
- Trial participants: half female, 83% White; 9.9% African America; 28% Hispanic/Latino
- 21% >65 years
- Some risk factors for severe illness: obesity (35%), diabetes 8%; pulmonary disease 8%
- 170 symptomatic COVID-19, 162 in placebo arm and 8 in vaccine arm so 95% effective
- 9 cases of severe disease all in placebo

• 2 shots, 4 weeks apart

moderna

- ~half female, 36.5% of participants communities of color
- 25%, ≥65 years of age
- Some risk factors for severe illness, including obesity (mean BMI 29.3)
- 196 symptomatic COVID-19, 185 in placebo arm and 11 in vaccine arm so 94.1% effective
- 30 cases of severe disease in placebo; 1 in vaccine arm



Johnson and Johnson 1-dose phase 3 trial

- 43,783 participants, 44% from US, 41% Central and South America, 15% South Africa
- 59% White; 45% Hispanic and/or Latinx; 17.2% AA or African; 9% Native American, 3% Asian
- 41% risk factors for severe illness, e.g. obesity or diabetes/
- 486 cases symptomatic COVID-19
- All hospitalizations (16) and deaths (9) from COVID-19 in placebo arm
- High efficacy against variants (95% B.1.351 S. Africa; 69% P1 Brazil) and 85% effective against all severe disease
- Variable against mild disease (72% U.S., 64% in South Africa, 61% Latin America)

Press release: Phase 3 ENSEMBLE trial; FDA document February 24, 2021

Johnson & Johnson

AstraZeneca two Lancet paper results together

- Between April 23 and Nov 4, 2020, 17,177 enrolled
- 619 PCR+ COVID-19 infections, of which 332 met the primary endpoint of symptomatic infection >14 days post dose.
- Primary analysis of overall vaccine efficacy >14 days after the second dose including LD/SD and SD/SD groups 66.7% (57.4%, 74.0%)
- Efficacy after a single dose of vaccine days 22-90 76% (59%, 86%),
- Severe outcome- 15 severe cases of COVID-19 all in the placebo group, none in vaccine group



Will vaccines work against variants and all against severe disease? Short answer: yes

Why T cell response will work against variants? First look at natural infection

Cell Reports Medicine

Article

Comprehensive analysis of T cell immunodominance and immunoprevalence of SARS-CoV-2 epitopes in COVID-19 cases

Graphical Abstract



Authors

Alison Tarke, John Sidney, Conner K. Kidd, ..., Daniela Weiskopf, Alba Grifoni, Alessandro Sette

Correspondence

agrifoni@lji.org (A.G.), alex@lji.org (A.S.)

In Brief

Tarke et al. show a broad T cell repertoire, suggesting that viral escape of T cell immunity is unlikely. CD4 immunodominant regions correlate with Broad T cell repertoire (100s of T cells across spike protein) after infection. Means viral escape of T cell-immunity (from both natural infection and vaccination) unlikely, re-infection if happens mild

Then look at T-cell response to variants after vaccines- still intact

bioRxiv

Negligible impact of SARS-CoV-2 variants on CD4+ and CD8+T cell reactivity in COVID-19 exposed donors and vaccinees.

Alison Tarke, John Sidney, Nils Methot, 💿 Yun Zhang, 💿 Jennifer M Dan, Benjamin Goodwin, Paul Rubiro,



¹Madhi. NEJM. March 16, 2021

- Looked at SARS-CoV-2-specific
 CD4+ & CD8+ T cell responses
 from those with natural infection
 with non-variant & examined
 activity against alpha, beta,
 gamma variants
- T cell reactivity against those variants remained intact if you had natural infection or mRNA vaccination (Pfizer/Moderna)
- CD4/CD8 responses in South Africa AztraZeneca trial¹ showed 75 out of 87 T cell epitopes in the spike protein remained unaffected by beta variant

AstraZeneca induces robust T cell responses against serious illness and death

Single vaccination with BNT162b2 or ChAdOx1 in older people induces equivalent

antibody generation but enhanced cellular responses after ChAdOx1

Parry H¹, Bruton R¹, Tut G¹, Ali M¹, Stephens C¹, Faustini S¹, Hughes S², Huissoon A^{1,2},



ure 2: ChAdOx1 induces stronger spike-specific cellular responses after single vaccination in older people

SARS-CoV-2 spike-specific cellular responses after single vaccination with BNT162b2 or ChAdOx1. Assessment is by IFN-y ELISpot. The total con-

THE LANCET

Interim findings from first-dose mass COVID-19 vaccination roll-out and COVID-19 hospital admissions in Scotland: a national prospective cohort study

Eleftheria Vasileiou*, Colin R Simpson*, Ting Shi*, Steven Kerr*, Utkarsh Agrawal, Ashley Akbari, Stuart Bedston, Jillian Beggs, Declan Bradley,

- 90% reduction in hospital admissions after just one dose of **AztraZeneca** vaccine in UK
- Same findings as in India in recent wave just 1 dose protected from severe disease (two doses better)



Thrombosis and Thrombocytopenia after ChAdOx1 nCoV-19 Vaccination

Nina H. Schultz, M.D., Ph.D., Ingvild H. Sørvoll, M.D., Annika E. Michelsen, Ph.D., Ludvig A. Munthe, M.D., Ph.D., Fridtjof Lund-Johansen, M.D., Ph.D., Maria T. Ahlen, Ph.D., Markus Wiedmann, M.D., Ph.D., Anne-Hege Aamodt, M.D., Ph.D., Thor H. Skattør, M.D., Geir E. Tjønnfjord, M.D., Ph.D., and Pål A. Holme, M.D., Ph.D.

Thrombotic Thrombocytopenia after ChAdOx1 nCov-19 Vaccination

Andreas Greinacher, M.D., Thomas Thiele, M.D., Theodore E. Warkentin, M.D., Karin Weisser, Ph.D., Paul A. Kyrle, M.D., and Sabine Eichinger, M.D.

Pathologic Antibodies to Platelet Factor 4 after ChAdOx1 nCoV-19 Vaccination

Marie Scully, M.D., Deepak Singh, B.Sc., Robert Lown, M.D., Anthony Poles, M.D., Tom Solomon, M.D., Marcel Levi, M.D., David Goldblatt, M.D., Ph.D., Pavel Kotoucek, M.D., William Thomas, M.D., and William Lester, M.D.

SARS-CoV-2 Vaccine–Induced Immune Thrombotic Thrombocytopenia

Douglas B. Cines, M.D., and James B. Bussel, M.D.

- VERY RARE clotting disorder after AZ or J&J vaccine, 1-7 in 1 million
 - 5-24 days after initial vaccine
 - Primarily women < 50
 - About 1 in 1 million incidence
 - Median platelet counts: 20,000-30,000
 - Improvement with IVIG, steroids





90.4% overall efficacy (primary endpoint) **100%** protection against moderate & severe disease

93.2% efficacy against Variants of Interest/Concern **91%** efficacy in "high-risk" populations

Two doses of NVX-CoV2373 vaccine are well-tolerated and show high levels of efficacy



Do vaccines reduce transmission? Short answer: yes

Will vaccines halt transmission? Biological plausibility (4 main reasons)

NVX-CoV2373 Protected Lower & Upper Airways in Rhesus Macaques No viral replication observed following Day 38 challenge with WT SARS-CoV-2



4. Challenge experiments with macaques in pre-clinical trials show blocking of viral replication (or no/low viral RNA) in BAL and nasal swabs (Mercado Nature J&J vax, 2020; Guebre-Xabier Vaccine Novavax 2020)

1. IgG antibodies measured in trials found in high levels in nasal mucosa

ers in Nology	REVIEW ARTICLE published: 16 July 2013 doi: 10.3389/fimmu.2013.00200	Para and a second secon
------------------	--	--

Antibodies and their receptors: different potential roles in mucosal defense

2. Systemic vaccines induce IgA (mucosal immunoglobulin) and recent study shows mRNA COVID-19 vaccines induce IgA

AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR MICROBIOLOGY

Parenteral Vaccination Can Be an Effective Means of Inducing Protective Mucosal Responses

BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES - ARTICLE

IMMU

SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccines induce a robust germinal centre reaction in humans

3. Monoclonal antibodies hasten viral clearance from airways



Studies to date that showed COVID-19 vaccines reduce asymptomatic infection (transmission)				
Setting	% reduction in asymptomatic infection or transmission	Reference		
Healthcare workers in England	85%	Hall Lancet, April 23, 2021		
Healthcare workers in Israel	75% and 86%	Amit, Lancet, March 6; Angel JAMA May 6		
Patients in Mayo Clinic health system	88.7%	Pawlowski medRxiv, February 27, 2021		
<mark>Israel Ministry of Health</mark> (nationwide)	94% (largest study)	Pfizer <u>press release</u> , March 11, 2021 (and <u>Goldberg Medrxiv</u> , April 24, 2021)		
Israel general population (Pfizer)	90%	Dagan NEJM, February 24, 2021		
Pre-surgical patients in Mayo Clinic system swabbed asymptomatically	80%	Tande Clin Inf Dis, March 10, 2021		
Healthcare workers in Cambridge University Hospitals	75%	Weekes Authorea, February 24, 2021		
First-line responders and HCWs in US	90%	Thompson A. MMWR, March 30, 2021		
Israel population (>16) with children unvaccinated	For every 20-point increase in adult vaccination, rates of kids testing positive halves	Milman O. Medrxiv. March 31, 2021		
Long-term care facility, Spain	90%	Salazar P. Medrxiv. April 13, 2021		
Nursing homes, U.S. (two studies)	100%	Cavanaugh MMWR, April 21 and Terran MMWR, April 30		
Nasal viral load values most importan	t determinant of transmissibility (Lancet study, Spain)	· Viral loads from nost-vaccination exposures		

Nasal viral load values most important determinant of transmissibility (<u>Lancet study</u>, Spain); Viral loads from post-vaccination exposures are low and likely noninfectious per CT values (use rapid antigen tests after vaccination if test symptomatic or incorporate CT)

How are vaccines working in real-world setting?

This is what mass vaccinated settings look like in the U.S.

Nursing homes



March 30, CMA data



The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

March 23, 2021

CORRESPONDENCE

SARS-CoV-2 Infection after Vaccination in Health Care Workers in California

UCSD and UCLA began vaccinating HCWs December 16, 2020 Weekly asymptomatic testing at UCSD Optional asymptomatic testing program at UCLA

379 Vaccinated HCWs tested positive between Dec 16 – Feb 9

- 71% tested positive within the first 2 weeks after 1st dose
- 7 out of 14,990 HCWs who were > 2 weeks after 2nd dose tested positive (0.05%)

CORRESPONDENCE

Early Evidence of the Effect of SARS-CoV-2 Vaccine at One Medical Center

Evaluation of SARS-CoV-2 infections at UT Southwestern December 15 – January 28 by vaccination status

• 4/8121 fully vaccinated employees (0.05%)



Keehner et al, NEJM 2021; Daniel et al, NEJM 2021



CDC

Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report (MMWR)

6 🖸 🛈

Interim Estimates of Vaccine Effectiveness of BNT162b2 and mRNA-1273 COVID-19 Vaccines in Preventing SARS-CoV-2 Infection Among Health Care Personnel, First Responders, and Other Essential and Frontline Workers — Eight U.S. Locations, December 2020–March 2021

Early Release / March 29, 2021 / 70

To put simply, 161 COVID infections out of 1000 unvaccinated; 1 out of 1000 if vaccinated



April 1 press release, 100% effectiveness in real-world against severe disease even against B.1.351

Pfizer and BioNTech Confirm High Efficacy and No Serious Safety Concerns Through Up to Six Months Following Second Dose in Updated Topline Analysis of Landmark COVID-19 Vaccine Study

- Analysis of 927 confirmed symptomatic cases of COVID-19 demonstrates BNT162b2 is highly effective with 91.3% vaccine efficacy observed against COVID-19, measured seven days through up to six months after the second dose
- Vaccine was 100% effective in preventing severe disease as defined by the U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and 95.3% effective in preventing severe disease as defined by the U.S. Food and Drug Administration
- Vaccine was 100% effective in preventing COVID-19 cases in South Africa, where the B.1.351 lineage is prevalent
- Vaccine safety now evaluated in more than 44,000 participants 16 years of age and older, with more than 12,000 vaccinated participants having at least six months follow-up after their second dose

Mayo Clinic HCWs Florida, Minnesota, AZ	ACCEPTED MANUSCRIPT Effectiveness of mRNA COVID-19 vaccines against SARS-CoV-2 infection in a cohort of healthcare personnel ∂ Melanie D Swift , Laura E Breeher, Aaron J Tande, Christopher P Tommas Caitlin M Hainy, Haitao Chu, PhD, MD, M Hassan Murad, Elie F Berbari, Abinash Virk Clinical Infectious Diseases, ciab361, https://doi.org/10.1093/cid/ciab361 Published: 26 April 2021 Article history y
Unvaccinated cohort 23,931 2-dose vax cohort 44,011	 96.8% effectiveness for Pfizer vaccine; 98.6% effectiveness for Moderna in real-world cohort (for both disease & asymptomatic infection)

To put simply, 36 symptomatic COVID infections out of 1000 unvaccinated; 0.4 out of 1000 if vaccinated (42 symptomatic+ symptomatic out of 1000 unvaccinated; 0.7 all infections out of 1000 if vaccinated)

Effectiveness of Pfizer-BioNTech and Moderna Vaccines Against COVID-19 Among Hospitalized Adults Aged ≥65 Years — United States, January-March 2021

Earlv Release / April 28. 2021 / 70



- Examined respiratory illness admissions among adults >65 from January 1, 2021–March 26, 2021 in 24 hospitals across 14 states as vaccines rolled out in this population
- Knew vaccine status and admissions for COVID-19 dropped by 64% after 1st dose and 94% after 2nd dose within this vulnerable group of older patients
- Defanging the virus in the population most at risk of severe illness in realtime during times of high circulating virus in the US (January-March 2021)

Cases continue to decline in Israel with mass vax despite opening

Impact and effectiveness of mRNA BNT162b2 vaccine against SARS-CoV-2 infections and COVID-19 cases, hospitalisations, and deaths following a nationwide vaccination campaign in Israel: an observational study using national surveillance data

THE LANCET

- More data on the real-world effectiveness of the vaccine despite B117 being 95% of SARS-CoV-2 infections during Israel roll-out Jan 24-April 3, 2021
- Pfizer vaccine 95% effective overall against symptomatic COVID-19
- 92% effective in preventing asymptomatic infection
- 98% effective against hospitalizations, 97% effective against death across all age groups even >=85 yrs
- Despite full opening March 2, 2021, cases continue to decline with fastest mass vaccination campaign on planet (and only >16 years vaccinated)



CDC breakthrough data



- CDC keeping track of breakthrough infections in U.S
- Out of >135 million Americans who are fully vaccinated against COVID-19
 - 2473 hospitalized breakthroughs (0.001%)
 - Deaths 0.0001% for COVID-19
- Not a single breakthrough infection has been reported to have transmitted

7 reasons don't think we will need boosters



- 1. Memory B cells can be triggered to produce neutralizing antibodies against an infection 90 years later!
- 2. Memory B cells generated by the COVID-19 mRNA vaccines (study did <u>lymph node</u> <u>biopsies</u>) and <u>natural infection</u>
- 3. Memory T cells generated by <u>natural</u> <u>infections</u>
- 4. T cell immunity <u>long-lasting</u> (measles vaccine 34 years & counting)
- 5. T cells work against variants
- 6. SARS-CoV (first SARS) T cell immunity <u>17</u> years later (pandemic 2003)
- 7. Coronaviruses don't mutate that fast (unlike HIV, influenza), <u>strong proofreading</u> <u>mechanism</u>, only when transmission high



Herd immunity: Form of indirect protection from an infection that occurs when a significant % of population has become immune (through vaccine or previous infection), so children, unvaccinated protected (does not mean eradication)

New names proposed for Covid variants 🕥 💿

Country/region	Scientific name	WHO name
Kent, UK	B.1.1.7	Alpha
South Africa	B.1.351	Beta
Srazil	P.1	Gamma
India	B.1.617.2	Delta

Summary



- Vaccine trials show amazing efficacy and safety
- All vaccines reduce severe disease significantly, likely due to T-cell response
- Vaccines decrease transmission
- Real world effectiveness even better than efficacy
- Variants can be managed
- 1st dose FIRST of AZ and J&J effective
- Rare safety concerns much more rare than COVID itself